

“Closed Captions” from
Nonviolent Response to Aggression

An online presentation by George Lakey, 3/20/2022
Sponsored by Santa Monica Friends Meeting

The following text was recorded by the “closed caption” transcription function of the Zoom videoconferencing platform. The text has been reformatted for readability, but not edited at all.

12:59:44 Yes, hello, Everyone welcome on behalf of the Santa Monica of Friends meeting the Quaker meeting, and it's Peace and Social Action Committee.

13:00:56 I want to welcome you all to this very special presentation with our presenter, George Lakey, who, I think every most of everyone knows, is a long time activist a scholar, a teacher, a writer, and who will be addressing what he has

13:01:12 termed the the good news about nonviolent resistance.

13:01:18 I want to thank George for taking the time to share his insights and experiences with us, and and I want to thank Mary Klein, the executive director of Western Friend Magazine for serving as our zoom host and for

13:01:31 spreading the word about this presentation, today's program will begin with approximately 10 min of silent worship, and then George, at the end of that period, or whenever he feels it's appropriate, we'll break that and speak for about

13:01:47 25 to 30 min, followed by a question and answer period of of approximately 15 min.

13:01:57 We'll end with 5 min of silent worship not hearing any audio.

13:02:04 If questions arise during George's talk. please, enter them in the chat, please type them into the chat, and Mary and I will select ones to read aloud to George George to answer the during the question and answer period.

13:02:26 Okay, Well, thank you again, and I guess we'll enter into grounding.

13:03:26 Shine your midnight protecting the Russian language in Ukraine.

13:09:34 You of me come back I don't know putin has a girlfriend.

13:09:38 Wife were killed in the hawaii I don't know.

13:09:48 Yes, an ex-wife 70 years divorced the fact that you are here probably means that your hearts have been stirred by what's been going on in the ukraine and that's certainly been true for

13:10:27 me hit me with a wallet back most days since the invasion started.

13:10:35 There's been a period when i've been crying I'm feeling so strongly, even though I've never worked in the Uk.

13:10:43 And don't have any friends who are Ukrainian.

13:10:49 I nevertheless feel very intensely what's going on, so you might wonder why I could call this good news, and it refers to and encounter the Gandhi head with someone Muhammad Gandhi the great

13:11:05 Indian leader, who who was encountered by someone who said, Mr.

13:11:11 Gandhi. You are always talking about nonviolence, nonviolence.

13:11:15 Is it ever okay to fight back when someone's? trying to hurt you is it ever okay to fight back violently And Gandhi said, Yes, if that's all the person can think of.

13:11:31 To do. However, I believe there's always a nonviolent path that can be pursued even in the midst of these weeks of amazing amounts of media coverage of the suffering and the horror of what's going on over

13:11:50 there and there there's also been heroic standing up in Russia itself in 100 cities, and also tremendous standing up in Ukraine, resisting oppression, resisting injustice. and so from a Gandhian point of

13:12:09 view. it's good news and one of the things I want to honor about the the possibilities that we all have when we see something terrible happening, and there's so little we can do we're so far from the conflict

13:12:26 Of course I send money to doctors beyond borders for medical assistance, and so on.

13:12:32 But feeling the powerlessness that comes from a great distance.

13:12:39 Geographically. But one thing that I i've learned to be able to do when things happen far away from me is to try to earn is try to honor, to try to honor those people who are going through that hard time to try to

13:12:57 learn from their experience. I know we often learn most vividly from our own painful experiences, but it's possible, thank God, because of the gift of empathy.

13:13:10 It's possible to learn from the experience of others and That's what we need to do that's at least what I need to do, and what i'm willing to share one of the things that I learned from this conflict that there's a

13:13:26 tremendous need for for innovation. How human beings wage struggle!

13:13:37 And when I think about innovation, naturally being a Quaker, go immediately to that place and ask myself, Well, are some of the forces that have been involved with Quakers innovating?

13:13:53 Because we do have a history of invasion and i've realized that one of the end impulses that drives us to to innovate is the the pressure of an ethic, a moral stand.

13:14:13 What we call a testimony about how things ought to be even if there's no apparent way to do that thing.

13:14:21 But the number of innovations that come from that ethical impulse are impressive.

13:14:30 I think, for example, of those seventeenth century quaker shopkeepers who who came to the belief that ethically it wasn't right to spend the day haggling over the price of the goods that they were

13:14:44 selling, because it seemed to those folks that there was a fair price for a particular product that someone wanted to buy that would take into account what it costs to make, and also what it costs him usually to sell and he ought to just put a price on

13:15:05 that thing, So people could come in and look at the brace and decide whether they can buy it or not.

13:15:12 Well as in many innovative tools that we invent, which are really against the mainstream, against conventional thinking.

13:15:26 The first shopkeepers who do that did that must have wondered. You know.

13:15:28 Am I going to be immediately out of business because everyone's haggling everywhere?

13:15:33 And of course what they found was that people shopped at Quaker.

13:15:37 Shopkeepers in droves, because it was a wonderful breakthrough and opened up a lot of time in the day when you didn't have to spend time haggling.

13:15:50 I think of another area of profound innovation by Quakers of mansion coming to the American frontier from England without a gun.

13:16:04 I try to imagine some farmer in northwest England. telling that telling his neighbor that the family was going to move to Pennsylvania and and the the neighbors saying, Well, I know you Quakers don't hold with guns but

13:16:15 you'll certainly take one for that right and I can imagine the farmers saying, No, no, we're not going to do that, and them getting into quite an argument with the with the neighbor attacking the farmer with irresponsibility and

13:16:30 uncaring toward his children, and so on, because he was exposing his family to such a enormous danger.

13:16:36 On the American frontier, and, as historians have discovered, Quakers were the safest people on the American frontier.

13:16:47 Over and over what we have found is that when we're driven to innovation by our ethical stands.

13:16:58 Some good things can come of it. so breakthroughs in human behavior can come from it.

13:17:04 That's what awakens me this very very hard thing to to watch. that's going on in the Ukraine.

13:17:15 How is it that innovation can happen, so that when one nation invades and tries to dominate another, that there can be a resistance?

13:17:26 Gandhi said, Resist no matter what resist, but nevertheless resist nonviolently now, fortunately, because I'm, historically oriented, I just love history.

13:17:38 I look in history to see whether there have been innovators when they've been Quakers or not who've made any kind of breakthrough on this, and I my very first thought when I started this line of reasoning was

13:17:52 Czechoslovakia, 1,968, because it was invaded by the Russians by the Soviet Union, and actually got its allies in the Warsaw Pact to participate as well so the troops

13:18:03 coming into Czechoslovakia in 1,968 in August, from from the Soviet Union, but also from Budapest, from from from neighboring Warsaw part packed countries, and what was

13:18:18 striking about that was that the the head of Czechoslovakia was a dictatorship.

13:18:26 But the reason why, for the invasion was that the dictatorship was becoming remarkably open.

13:18:31 There'd, been a Prague Spring there been a tremendous ferment, and and some of the old dictatorial ways were we, and that that that struck Moscow as outrageous, and they wanted to put a

13:18:44 stop to that and Dooop check the leader of checks.

13:18:50 Lucky refused to put a stop to it and so they thought, Well, then, we're just going to have to dominate the country again and set things right.

13:18:55 And so there they were, pouring across the border.

13:18:58 Well do. Check knew in the hours just before that that he was likely to be arrested, taken Moscow shot.

13:19:05 But at least he could minimize the damage. and so he locked the troops.

13:19:10 The military troops in the barracks to make sure there would not be a military conflict, or at least to make that less likely.

13:19:19 And then the next day, was he ever surprised when people resisted the incoming invasion in profoundly innovative ways?

13:19:29 There were people who would stand in a bridge and refuse to move unarmed people, and refused to move until the tank itself turned around and tried to find some other way.

13:19:39 There was a tactic which also was picked up here in Ukraine.

13:19:44 The last couple of weeks of of turning the turning the directional signs round, so that the invading troops couldn't find out where they were, and which way to go.

13:19:53 There were many, many tactics that the checks and slow box came up with, that were intensely interactive.

13:20:05 That really really put them knows who knows with the invading troops.

13:20:10 Now the reason why that was so important is because the the Soviet soldiers were, of course, conscripts, and and from the other countries as well, they didn't want to be doing this, and and and and here they were meeting you know

13:20:22 people like themselves, who didn't want to be dominated and intense, intense confrontations happen, and sometimes not so intense, and some somewhat more amusing.

13:20:35 For example, in one case that I read of when I was doing this research, I found that actually, in more than one case, there were young lovers who decided to make out in front of the invading troops and say to the troops hey

13:20:51 Ivan wouldn't you like to be home doing this instead of being here.

13:20:56 In other words, upping the ante with regard to interaction, such as to make it harder for the troops to be maintaining the morale.

13:21:07 What happened was, the troops started to melt within 3 days like butter in the sun, and and third day that the Soviets actually started to rotate their troops back in to the Soviet Union because they couldn't be

13:21:19 counted upon to to inflict the damage that the Soviets were were planning to inflict.

13:21:26 So that was a remarkable remarkable demonstration of people's spontaneous standing up for themselves.

13:21:35 What happened was that instead of Duchess the leader being shot in Moscow, as he expected, he was sat down and negotiated with, and an accommodation was reached.

13:21:45 Such that the Czechoslovakia people were not dominated by the Soviet Union, but but their existing government continued, but with rules that were less liberal, and it took then some years before another opening happened.

13:22:02 And then checks. and so box so rose up nonviolently, and we're able to change their don their form into democratic democratic practice.

13:22:13 So that's one example that's very heartening to me another example that came to me very quickly was that in the war valley, in 1,923 in Germany Germany having been just just defeated in world war

13:22:27 one. Into the Roar Valley poured troops from Belgium and France.

13:22:32 Who had won the war and were Upset because the seal and the coal region of Germany, was not producing goods fast enough to get the reparations going to Belgium, and and France at the level 2 for through which they've been promised and so they

13:22:52 invaded in order to force this to happen, and of course there was no chance of military resistance in that case, because the journey had just been defeated in the war.

13:23:01 And so the Government said, How about you folks in the roar?

13:23:05 Go on strike, which is a nonviolent tool, and that's exactly what happened.

13:23:12 Mass non-cooperation. The miners refused to mind cold.

13:23:15 They said, Well, you've got banners, See how far you get mining cool with bayonets.

13:23:20 And and this became a stalemated struggle in which the Belgians and the French did not get what they wanted.

13:23:32 And finally an international face-saving commission, led by an American, was set up in order to work out an arrangement by which Belgium and France could withdrawal without having forced the Germans to do what the Germans, said that they could not

13:23:44 do so. Here were some innovations they were quakers can't take credit for those they were innovations in the heat of conflict.

13:23:54 One of the things that impresses me about both of them is that they have happened without training of the people, nor a clear strategy that could be impossible to the people.

13:24:08 So it was very, very spontaneous. What happened now?

13:24:13 If you asked a military commander, how would you, like to go into some kind of major struggle without a strategy, and with soldiers who weren't trained, they would laugh at you because, of course, training and strategy are essential for effective

13:24:31 and efficient combat. but in, and that is actually equally true, it's not as true in nonviolent struggle, but it hugely makes a difference.

13:24:44 If, for example, the the young people from the North in the United States who went to Mississippi to face the Ku Klux Klan in 1,964 freedom summer, I was one of the trainers for

13:24:56 that for the training, the training for the 1,000 young people who went south.

13:25:04 Of course they, the civil Rights understood movement understood that the the these young people couldn't be counted on to be the nonviolent soldiers that they wanted them to be. if they didn't have training first training is is a very

13:25:20 very important part of increasing the effectiveness of nonviolence, just as it is for increasing the effectiveness of violence and the cases.

13:25:31 And I could go into more cases if you like are striking for how spontaneously were without training, and usually without the leadership that could offer a clear strategy.

13:25:43 Now i'll point. to 2 more examples of of his historical comparison, because there's there's sad news As a result of this comparison, This is a comparison between Norway and Denmark's

13:26:00 experience in meeting German invasion do during World War Ii.

13:26:05 Nazi. Germany wanted both Denmark and Norway under their heel move troops into both of them.

13:26:13 Very different responses in Denmark. The Government's decision was much like that of the Czechoslovak is leader, Duchess, which was locked.

13:26:24 The troops in the barracks now do not resist militarily.

13:26:28 Obviously we're going to be overwhelmed just as as those other cases I mentioned.

13:26:36 Obviously, militarily. We will be overwhelmed right so we're not going to play that game instead.

13:26:41 We'll see what develops. Well, what developed again with that strategy without training was such an effective nonviolent resistance on the part of the Danes that they were able to foil some of the biggest objectives that the

13:26:56 German occupation had. One was to get one ships for fighting The war, especially the the front with Britain, needed more ships, and the Danish workers.

13:27:08 The best shipbuilders in the world arguably suddenly became totally clumsy, and couldn't manage to put it together.

13:27:18 Some of the half-built ships were towed, to Hamburg and Germany to be finished, because the Germans couldn't get these workers to do the job, and and and and of course, a very important very very important

13:27:32 objective from Hitler's point of view was to round up the the Jews of Denmark, and take them to concentration camps, and the again outwitted by the nonviolent resistance which thanks to a

13:27:50 leak. By the way, I was talking about trying to get the occupying forces to melt right there's a leak from the the the occupiers to the themes saying, This is the date we're supposed to round up all

13:28:04 the Jews. It was in time. Instead, the Jews were put on fishing ships, fishing a Danish fishing roads and taken to Sweden in safety, and almost all the Danish shoes were saved so that that is one

13:28:19 case, but against the same opponent now we're talking Nazi, Germany.

13:28:23 You have the dame the Norwegian decision to resist militarily, and they did.

13:28:28 They resisted militarily in the South. We ways a very, very long country, you know.

13:28:34 They resisted, retreating, retreating, retreating, retreating up to the up to beyond.

13:28:40 The architect circle, and an incredible wreckage and considerable bloodshed happen.

13:28:51 As a result of that struggle, were they overwhelmed?

13:28:55 Of course they were overwhelmed. And so what contrast between Denmark, Norway in terms of lives, loss, people, suffering roughly production and the and the destruction of the economic infrastructure?

13:29:16 By the time I got to Norway as a student in 1,95914 years after the war was over I found that in Norway they were still rationing some goods, whereas rationing in the U s

13:29:28 you know, and and very soon after World War II. the The rationing was continuing in some respects in Norway.

13:29:34 Still 14 years later, that's how badly the economy was hammered.

13:29:41 Well, comparing, comparing, and again the brilliant dataist resistance. There was also brain, no reason.

13:29:48 Resistance. once the occupation was set. Then people started spontaneously, not violently innovating and doing.

13:29:56 Some beautiful, beautiful work, retaining the integrity of the schools, retaining the integrity of the churches.

13:30:03 Both of which were, you know, the Nazis wanted to take over. so there was a lot.

13:30:09 There was a lot of excellent norwegian nonviolent resistance, but it took took place in the context of already having lost the military struggle in which a lot of people had their hearts.

13:30:23 And so there's. all that problem about how do you shift gears when you come into a defeat as compared with the the Danish resistance.

13:30:34 Okay, So what's the big picture of comparing these 2 these 2 ways of resisting Gandhi said, Yes, if you don't know any better if you can't think of anything else, to do resist violently But resist nonviolently, if

13:30:50 you're willing to be an innovator. Figure it out try something, and what the statistics show is that the the the i'll refer to the book because some of you may know this book already.

13:31:09 It's it's, political scientists who did a workup of all the cases of national level struggle from 1,900 to 2,006, and they they look then, at each case determine whether it could be called

13:31:28 nonviolent, or whether it could be called violent, and then compared their success ratio.

13:31:34 What they found with regard to occupations was that most occupiers were able to maintain their domination despite resistance.

13:31:49 But in 35% of the cases of resistance against an occupier.

13:31:57 The people on the ground we're able to win so odds weren't great one-third possibility.

13:32:06 But one third success, but they also compared. What about those who resisted nonviolently?

13:32:13 And what are those who resisted? violently that's like the Danish Norwegian comparison right What they found was pretty much the same success rate.

13:32:25 In other words, and this is mind-blowing in the American content.

13:32:30 Culture, where we all know that violence is a way to go.

13:32:32 Violence is more powerful than nonviolence. right? How many of us have been taught that since we were little well turns out just not to be true.

13:32:41 They have the same success rate violence. Actually, nonviolence has a slightly better success rate.

13:32:49 But you know, given statistics I wouldn't want to claim too much for that.

13:32:53 I would just say, a slightly better chance of success for those movements.

13:33:00 The resisted occupation nonviolently but here's what's more, it just as interesting to me which is that the non those who chose to resist occupying nonviolently one more quickly than those who resisted

13:33:17 violently that's an important matter how long do you want to be in struggle.

13:33:22 It's exhausted, and there are casualties So they got quicker success by choosing nonviolence.

13:33:30 Furthermore, the the cases in which people were nonviolently resisting were able to establish democratic governance more quickly than those who resisted violently.

13:33:48 In fact, many of those who resisted violently the invasion.

13:33:52 By an adjoining nation found that they never were able to achieve democratic governance, even though they tried.

13:34:05 So this is like the shopkeepers right. Shopkeepers try something as Mike.

13:34:10 I might go out of business when I try this, and oh, my gosh!

13:34:12 Is it works? This might be like a Quakers on the American frontier.

13:34:17 Whoa! safer than you know. They Baptist down the street.

13:34:24 Got a gun their surprises and that's good news there's, surprises involve embedded in the peace testimony.

13:34:33 If we are courageous enough to fully embody the peace testimony, which means nonviolently struggling for goals that are important to struggle for.

13:34:50 And if we further make it likely we will succeed by being trained to do so by developing strategic plans for doing so, then we can expect frequent breakthroughs, even in a country like this.

13:35:10 The America that I know now, which is arming up like crazy, which has militias organizing and growing, and it's very easy to predict lots of violence in the future.

13:35:23 Right. So this is. this is another element of what I think can be claimed.

13:35:30 Good news. Now, finally, on a Ukraine point of view with regard to the Ukraine situation, a surprise to me was learning and researching for this that there was a public opinion survey done in 2,015 by a

13:35:49 Sociology Institute in Ukraine, which was curious about what the people might.

13:35:58 There were already indications from Russia of course, that an invasion might be in the offing.

13:36:06 So they were curious about what what were the people's inclinations given that kind of scenario, 2,015 was after dumb boss had been much invaded after the seizure of Crimea, right so the the

13:36:20 the researchers who did this study pretty much expected most everybody would line up.

13:36:24 Well, we have to do it about a defense. And why not?

13:36:29 Because in almost all countries that's what conventional wisdom says, is the right thing to do.

13:36:33 Yes, Ok. turns out but they gave options. They gave options in the service, so they gave one option.

13:36:42 You could, you would. But you think of civil resistance, which is a kind of code for nominal resistance as compared with model resistance.

13:36:51 More Ukrainians in that survey, Pre said they preferred to do not resistance or civil resistance, as they called it.

13:36:59 Then preferred to do violent resistance so that's something to think about as well.

13:37:11 Yes, there's a history. there's history 2,004 Ukrainians over through a dictatorship nonviolently right.

13:37:24 So they had some number of muscles there, and very pleased with themselves, and then in 2,014, when they're their governmental leader, was moving toward dictatorship, threw him out as well, not violently with some exceptions,

13:37:39 but largely not modeling. So, in other words, the Ukrainian people themselves had been doing innovation.

13:37:48 They had been discovering the power of nonviolence themselves, and that accounts for that.

13:37:56 That that slight preference for nonviolently resisting an invasion, should it occur as already in 2,015.

13:38:04 It was looking looking pretty dicey. Okay, I'd like to finally just mention some resources because some of the things that I've referred to are probably of interest you for following up. so the the cases that I referred to in

13:38:24 Ukraine and Denmark and Norway can be found here on the global non-linear action database.

13:38:30 It's a online database that you can just search and find very easily.

13:38:35 And it's been put online by schwarzenegger. While I was teaching in Swarthmore, we put over a 1,000 cases the nonviolent struggle in history on this database.

13:38:45 So you might enjoy that. And as I, as I say, you can look into those particular particular cases that way.

13:38:58 And then the other thing i'd like to point out is that waging nonviolence continues to be in husband now for years a solid place to turn to an online publication for articles by me and colleagues of mine and people I don't even

13:39:13 know, but who are wonderful writers and researchers, who are constantly keeping abreast of what are the very often remarkable, very often remarkable achievements of the innovators.

13:39:32 And if we need innovation, and conflict let's coach ourselves let's turn to the resources. Let's turn other people onto those resources as well.

13:39:44 Thank you. Thank you very much, George. people have already started doing.

13:39:56 If you have a question to ask George in this next little question and answer period, please type it into the chat.

13:40:04 And then Mary and I will take turns, and choosing a question and reading it aloud for George to answer.

13:40:17 I see Curtis. Yes, I just want to interject.

13:40:20 There would be a number of questions about a recording. So I hope folks notice that this is being recorded.

13:40:27 Santa Monica meeting, and George will both be making the recording available.

13:40:34 You can find Santa Monica meeting online, George.

13:40:38 You might let folks know how they would find the recording from you and

13:40:52 I will post the chat notes on the Western friend website, and get those to Curtis and George also, so there's a lot of notice in the chat that will be

13:41:03 You know the folks will might want to have access to. I just want to confess that we were a little nervous about opening the chat up to everyone given.

13:41:17 How some of the Zoom events concerning Ukraine have happened, so we wanted to keep a little bit more control over this meeting than then.

13:41:24 We might otherwise. So Nope i'm done okay, i'm choosing one question.

13:41:35 Yeah, George is putting his email address in he's holding it up there, and perhaps Mary will put that in the chat as well.

13:41:41 I'll put that in the chat thank you George one question I'm.

13:41:46 Seeing is it reads I have seen. we find it here again.

13:41:54 Okay. I have seen music being played in the streets and people in in people standing in front of tanks.

13:42:01 Are there other examples of nonviolent resistance?

13:42:05 In Ukraine today that you are aware of.

13:42:09 My favorite example is an old woman coming up to these soldiers with packets of sunflower seeds.

13:42:20 Say Here, please, dear, put put this in your pocket so that if you don't make it out of here.

13:42:24 There'll be some flowers that will bloom wherever it is that you fall.

13:42:34 And and so some somebody showed me the video I don't know how to get the video.

13:42:37 But but but you see, the soldiers being so uncomfortable and really wanting her to be gone, you know, because it's so so uncomfortable.

13:42:44 But she's this old lady what are you going to do you know you don't feel threatened by her.

13:42:50 And there she is, the same. you might die but at least you you know you'll be redeemed by the sunflowers in this packet.

13:43:04 Yes, sir, there's another example that some of you will remember the tank man of tenement square, who stood in front of a row of tanks.

13:43:15 Something like that happened also that was caught by I forget which media agency is showing that the young man with his hands up, clearly not violent, right clearly not threatening anybody, and standing right in front of the tank and then pushing with his

13:43:34 chest, like you know, and the and the tank driver backing up slightly as he's pushing the tank.

13:43:42 Another example that I think i've been reading is is several people together, standing unarmed, and again with hands up to show in front of the truck front truck of a convoy of a Russian conroy boy in such a way

13:44:02 that a narrow road is such a way that the trucks, in order to get by him and them, had to sort of go way over into the shoulder in some of precarious grounding.

13:44:16 You know to get by because that's how much the driver didn't want to drive over these nonviolent you who they didn't know at all.

13:44:28 If Harvard nonviolence is really quite extraordinary.

13:44:33 But it takes some experimentation right in order for yourself i've been pulled. Knives have been pulled on me 3 times in my life, and and I've been surrounded by hostile gang late at night that kind, of thing and

13:44:43 I just figure well try this try this and if i've Heard a story about somebody who's been you know in a hustle and counter. maybe a life-threatening encounter.

13:44:56 I'll try and the story worked for them i'll try it out for me.

13:44:59 So how, having that experimental approach, I think, makes so much sense in an area where so many people are stuck, so many people are stuck with this.

13:45:10 Ideology that prizes violence. Married? You want to choose a question.

13:45:30 There are a number of questions in the chat concerning What if you know of any organizing that's going on in Ukraine organizing, and that there was a mention of a Peace Institute in Ukraine that might

13:45:43 have been attacked. you said anything you know about i'm afraid I don't, don't!

13:45:49 Oh, there's tons of organizing, in the sense of you know, organizing for survival.

13:45:55 But I think as far as organizing a resistance. people are primarily involved with just survival needs right now, assisting refugees, and so on.

13:46:06 It's over 3,000,000 Now who've left yeah it's It's a that's another advantage, you know, from a strategic point of view.

13:46:15 What you want in a country that's occupied in order to if you were a you know a nonviolent general.

13:46:25 What you would want is massive amounts of human capital to throw against your enemy.

13:46:29 Right. So those are 3,000,000 people already out of the population of 40,000,000 who have exited the country.

13:46:35 If you were. If you were a Gandhi you would say no, you don't exit.

13:46:38 Stay here and we'll fight together and we'll be nonviolent. and we'll win.

13:46:45 But the yeah yeah, but but at this point it's a matter of survival, because the choice to resist militarily means then everything's about survival, and that makes it very very hard to organize and affect the resistance.

13:47:03 Maybe there's something going on I don't know there are also a number of questions about organizing here situation, and and I've also note that there's lots of specific questions in the chat that you will be interested to respond

13:47:19 to individually later, but but organizing in the Us. concerning the current situation.

13:47:32 Well, if you have influence on the the power elite, please use it for not increasing the amount of firepower available in that situation.

13:47:49 The more weapons there are there, the more will be discharged right, and the more people who will be killed it's a kind of fest that's going on and Biden is yielding to pressure and sending more and

13:48:10 more weapons there. Of course, the military industrial complex would be delighted, because those are weapons that need to be replaced by us.

13:48:19 Tax dollars. Amen. But I hope that if you have any influence it's. It's very hard to start now a movement that you know a mass movement that could be effective because these are decisions being made by a very small group of people very

13:48:41 distant sociologically from us. But, anyway, if you do happen to be part of that magic circle, sure use your influence by reducing the amount of harm that we're exporting means of harm, George you mentioned before the example of the tank

13:49:00 man and of Taneman Square, and that I think, for many people, many of us speaking.

13:49:07 Is when we think of a failed incidence of nonviolent resistance.

13:49:15 That is a very powerful one that comes to mind. But I think you how would you address like?

13:49:20 If someone, if someone immediately goes there and they're thinking Oh, this is what nonviolent resistance is.

13:49:29 It's futile will get you killed what would you what's your brief response to that right?

13:49:35 Well, the I think the statistics are really compelling about that. two-thirds of the cases of resistance by violence failed, and two-thirds of them that resisted nonviolently failed roughly

13:49:52 two-thirds. So it's very often the people who challenge, and I've been challenged now for 60 years about nonviolence. Assume the unstated assumption is violence is more powerful so they're saying,

13:50:11 you know well in Tinman Square that was a glorious, non-final resistance, and it failed right.

13:50:17 So, therefore, therefore, what that? A violent resistance would have seen that's the unstated assumption, because there there is this belief.

13:50:28 Goes even beyond earlier than John Wayne the thing to do to be powerful is to be violent, and that's just not true.

13:50:40 It's just not true and that's why this book is so important.

13:50:45 These just a brief story will help you on this. These 2 people, Eric Schmidt with and and Maria Stephen Stefan, who, I know our political scientists in the sub field of political science, called security, studies which tends to

13:50:59 attract the most hard nose to the political side of it and i'm. You know i'm soft-nosed i'm sociologists. but these are the hard-nosed people right, and they love statistics, and how however,

13:51:09 Maria happened to believe that that non-violent resistance could often have big payoff, and she was in an argument with Erica about that.

13:51:20 And she's okay, I want to challenge you Why, don't we do a statistical study and find out what's really So you're assuming the violence is more powerful.

13:51:28 But let's find out if i'm willing to submit to the evidence.

13:51:33 If you are well, okay, because i'm sure i'm right Thanks, Erica.

13:51:38 Right. So they go to work, and they look at all the cases from 1,900 to 2,006, which is 323 cases, and they look at every single one, and they rate them by degree of success or degree of failure

13:51:50 and what they find over all. Now I was doing a subcategory of occupations.

13:51:57 The overall picture from that 323 case. The statistical array is that you doubled your chances of success.

13:52:07 If you chose not violence as your beings, you doubled your chance of success.

13:52:15 If you chose. nonviolent means Now that to many people that I know sounds like craziness.

13:52:25 Well guess what it's hard boil political science and it it rock the field of political scientists of political science itself rocked it because the statistics were all in here carefully revealed as scholars.

13:52:40 Very often do, and so they can run the statistical array themselves and see if they come up with a different different, different thing.

13:52:48 And nobody has. Nobody has come up with a different look at the 323 cases, and come to some different conclusion.

13:52:55 In other words, this is solid, but just like the people who don't believe in their vaccination.

13:53:03 We have, as in general, a culture that doesn't believe in nonviolence, and therefore each movement, I mean think how hard Dr.

13:53:12 King had to work on that. Each movement has to rediscover the superior power of nonviolence, and when it pushed, comes to shove the when there are actual comparisons that can be made taking everything into account it's

13:53:27 quite clear that nonviolent power is greater than violent power.

13:53:32 But the assumption that lurks behind every challenge of will this nonviolent movement didn't work. is that violence would have no violence, most likely would have been even a bigger failure, because George, the corruption yes, yes, go.

13:53:59 For it. yay go for it. she's muted there's couple questions in the chat here about positive actions that we ought to be pressuring the power elite.

13:54:30 To take. Are there ideas that you have? And there was a question about how to make peacemaking profitable.

13:54:42 Yes, I I wrote a book about that called Strategy for a living revolution, and that proposes that we tilt the structure of what works such a way that peace making will visibly pay off.

13:55:10 Now that, however, assumes that book strategy, for a living revolution assumes that we will have have to displace the economic lead of the United States in order to create that society.

13:55:26 And that's because the economic, elite of the united States is deeply, deeply invested in the profits that come from the military industrial complex, deeply deeply invested in those both directly in terms of just the

13:55:43 swallow size of it, but also in terms of the maintenance of the American Empire, from which other sources of money come.

13:55:52 So we've got an economic elite that is very clear that by violence is the way to go, and and so it's not possible to for our country to take a different posture as long as the economic elite happens to be in charge

13:56:08 now is the economic Elite in charge or maybe we're a democracy who knows? Well, some people, some researchers have looked into that as well, and the Princeton study is really worth looking at.

13:56:22 You can go online and find the Princeton Oligarchy study, because the the Bbc account of the study they called it the Oligarchy study.

13:56:32 And so it got to be called that this authors themselves these Princeton's College didn't call it oligarchy.

13:56:38 But what they did say was that they they did a statistical way.

13:56:43 Their political scientists. They love such a school race. So they did a statistical ray of a couple of decades of national decisions, policy decisions that were made in the United States, and they they compared for each of these decisions what was the opinion.

13:56:57 Of the economic elite on this decision before it was made, and what was the opinion of the majority of American people?

13:57:07 Now, of course, in some cases the economically happened to agree with the majority of American people so cool.

13:57:14 But what about if the economic elite disagreed with the majority opinion? which side one?

13:57:21 What the Princeton study shows is that in the overwhelming number of cases in which there was a disagreement.

13:57:30 It was the economic elite's view that carried the day and that the Government went ahead and implemented. so the conclusion of the study.

13:57:38 Just go online and find this the conclusion of this study obviously written in reluctance that if you call democracy majority rule, that's not what we've got.

13:57:56 Okay, Well, they were being honest. They were being faithful to the facts as they as they understood them.

13:57:59 Are they alone? No, the international rating agency that lists all the countries in the world by degree of democracy. The first, they have 4 categories from democracy in the top.

13:58:14 To, you know, dictatorship on the bottom 4 different categories of governments.

13:58:17 The U. S. for many years was in the top category.

13:58:21 Democratic. It has officially slipped out of that category as of I think it was 6 or 8 years ago.

13:58:28 I'm Not i'm not sure exactly when we we lost our status of that kind that is the evidence by people who are interested in evidence.

13:58:37 The evidence of increasingly is that we don't live in a democracy. that means that we like the Ukrainians, like many people peoples around the earth, have had to figure out how can we overthrow whatever you want to call

13:58:57 it to overthrow the oligarchy, overthrow the dictatorship over there, whatever you want to call it, and we have to figure that out.

13:59:05 So what I did was wrote a book about how we could do that stage by stage, and it's a 5 stage framework, a strategic framework, and I invite you to to look at it It's in paperback, and George the name of that

13:59:22 book that particular book again. Maybe it's now called it keeps changing its title, because when it goes from hard cover to paperback, and so on.

13:59:33 So I think the latest style is toward yes, toward a living revolution, toward a living revolution.

13:59:39 You could search by author. That makes it easy. but toward the living revolution, because what the concept that I wanted to build into the title that was really important to me was living revolution.

13:59:49 That is a revolution that's on the side of life including an ecological view.

13:59:56 What of what life is about a big picture ecological view that includes other species, and so on.

14:00:03 And and so that's that's built into that framework i'm aware of the time, and i'm aware that we are obviously and by number, and the the scope of the questions being asked very good questions in the chat

14:00:21 this kind of conversation about finding another way another way that you know, honors life more than what we are present ways of doing things.

14:00:30 Can go in different all directions in many different directions.

14:00:35 And and this was just, unfortunately, but fortunately a sample of where this issue in this one-hour program.

14:00:45 So I think we're about at the stage of going into 5 min of silent worship.

14:00:52 But before I do that, George are married, Did you have anything you wish to add?

14:01:01 I guess the one thing i'll say is that if anyone wants to try to transcripts and recordings.

14:01:09 I I George's email is in the chat I'll put that in there one more time you can go to the Santa Monica website.

14:01:18 You could also go to the Western Friend website, and we have a a newsletter that comes out once a week called Extra Extra Western Friend.

14:01:26 So if you find extra extra Western friend on the Western friend website, if there will be a page that i'll put out next Saturday that will consolidate as much as it notes and chat comments and everything as I can

14:01:44 from today and it's it's really wonderful all the part that people have poured into the chat, and i'm sorry that we didn't have enough time to actually let people to ask their questions live because i'm

14:02:00 I'm sure a lot of people had a lot that they wanted to say and ask, Well, I am.

14:02:08 I live your life. Yes. Well, I hope that this will be encouragement for friends to, and everyone watching to go to the waging nonviolence website and read the bonus articles because i've published over a 100 there that

14:02:23 have dealt with, how to respond to fascists if they're fascist in your neighborhood.

14:02:31 Just all kinds of questions of personal safety How do we mean you know ourselves a good chance for personal safety, even if there's an assailant out there who's wanting to get us and I've just dealt with a whole lot

14:02:43 of the different questions that come up with regard to violence and conflict and economic oppression and environmental oppression.

14:02:51 Each. the columns but i'm not alone by any means raising Obama's has a lot of fascinating writers who tend to harvest their stuff by by publishing and waging

14:03:05 nonviolence. Well, thank you George very much and with that we'll.

14:03:12 We'll enter into a period of closing of about 5 min. and look, we'll break at that point Thank you for all your years of teaching, George.

14:06:07 Thank you, Santa Monica, meeting for instigating this time together.

14:06:17 Thank you, everyone, for your love for our life on this world.

14:06:27 Amen. Amen. Thank you again, George. amen, bless you George and my friend Rolling Adams is here, who's just out of Kern Valley State Prison for a couple days, and this is his first zoom.

14:06:53 Well, Hi Ali, pleased to see you. Thanks, Dad. It wonderful to to know you were here.

14:06:59 I know. Talk about Russia. huh? Yeah, we could talk, but well, we what we could share.

14:07:10 Yes, you know the the book project that that I was in is coming out with the Ukrainian book.

14:07:17 It's ready to go to press and we're gonna have to get some of these other stories in it.

14:07:23 But how's that for being on time how about that right on time? He's taken years to put it together, and here's my friend friend Ali, that i've been mentoring for a couple of years Oh, wonderful what a great face you

14:07:39 have all the I almost guys all he's in California he's in California.

14:08:01 I'm here, and and and we were on the a facetime call, and I said, Oh, I have to go and I said, Why don't I take you to the meeting too?

14:08:13 So I can open up the phone. so we can see you Well, i'll be coming to California on my book tour in the fall.

14:08:19 Oh, my book comes out. my memoir comes out November fifteenth.

14:08:21 So i'll be coming to California and to Florida in all kinds of places.

14:08:27 So look for me towards what is that book be titled, Hey, David?

14:08:34 And Jan George, this is Gail. I just want to thank you for doing this.

14:08:45 We had over 400 people. we're under people that's a lot. I know it was quite amazing.

14:08:53 So I thank you so much. Wonderful congratulations to you for getting the word out so well.

14:08:59 This is David in Ohio. I want to invite you in subsequent presentations, to raise up the examples of what's happening in Russia in terms of undermining the autocracy of the power of the military the

14:09:15 non-cooperation. The the journalists the resignations you're collecting them now.

14:09:23 Go spread them right. Excellent point I left that out completely right and it's very. it's very inspiring.

14:09:29 There's an erroric to do that hi caroline good to see you, too.

14:09:37 Oh, oh, my goodness! if the New York time today has an article about all the people, all the Russians fleeing Russia!

14:09:46 Just afraid the iron curtain is going to clamp down again.

14:09:49 So it's. Oh, yes, well, that's what they pretty much have to do right in putin's view.

14:09:57 Well, yeah, yeah, George, George, my meeting go ahead. My meeting ended a few minutes early today.

14:10:09 Specifically so friends could join this presentation. Oh, marvelous!

14:10:14 Which meeting is that apple seed monthly meeting in Katati, California.

14:10:21 Whoa. Oh, i'm honored well it's a great privilege to be able to share this information with folks, especially fellow Quakers.

14:10:29 I just really so appreciate that chance when it's just heavy on the heart, and there's no chance to express it.

14:10:36 It's It makes the path harder George yeah I have a crazy idea?

14:10:45 Why don't we smuggle this presentation and all the other information about civilian resistance into Russia Via diplomatic curry, and then planted it around in bookstores, libraries?

14:10:58 Wherever yeah, CD-dvds and along with sunflower seas. I didn't put it on balloons at the shooting.

14:11:07 One flower seats plan, and and we could send in with small drones.

14:11:11 This would of embassies. Yes, in Russia stop the war.

14:11:23 Great idea, great But that's what every citizen can do It's more cost effective than guns and bombs and going to World War Ii.

14:11:39 There we go, George George, I emailed you I I Oh, I wrote about putin.

14:11:47 Oh, i'd like to Oh, I will read it after this after this closes.

14:11:51 Thank you, Hey, George? Thank you yeah, hi! i'm linda from Santa Fe, and I had a question.

14:12:01 I wondered if in of some form, or now, can you speak to the unique circumstances of this war?

14:12:10 In contrast those examples that you gave us, I think, of 2 just now, which is the targeting of civilians with these very technical weapons that can be sent to in terms of precision, which hit both as you know, the theater and

14:12:31 also of school, which was a great unknown here, in terms of how many people did lose their lives since they were there as a safe place, a bunker, and then the other. thing I think, of is the development of nuclear options that change

14:12:52 decision-making, ongoing. So I wanted to have you speak to that today about those differences that exist in the in the present moment of this war will, I think it makes all the more important that we move away from violence because the technology that

14:13:12 you're referring to of violence, keeps growing and growing, growing right and more and more effect for this, so the idea that you know violence is the answer when it just keeps getting more and more destructive and more and more precisely

14:13:28 destructive. strikes me as the the American colonists really did have a much better chance against the Mar against the British musket.

14:13:41 The carriers then than than people do now, and that needs to be taken into account by the leadership.

14:13:48 Yeah, I leadership on our side. in view of the saturation of violence in our own country.

14:13:57 Right pressure point here that as you've spoken to today is very, very difficult in terms of our current leadership, right?

14:14:05 The trouble is, our current leadership makes so much money out of the military industrial complex which makes its money out of the technological development you're talking about, you know.

14:14:16 Bring the new weapon to Congress and get funding for it.

14:14:19 And so I I don't have much hope for the the American leadership because they're there.

14:14:26 They just suck sock away the money right? But that does make things a little bit scary in terms of these accelerating confrontations with middle options right now.

14:14:39 Present moment, maybe our. I spent my much of my time in Los Alamos, protesting my lifetime, and it was discouraging to see how Auntie is just being up and up in terms of development of them at this time in

14:14:56 our country That's right that's right that's all How about the use of nonviolence and yemen and other places?

14:15:09 Where you is the aggressor. Oh, yes, that's it That's another reason why we don't want to leave them.

14:15:16 The the violence paradigm? Why? we're not going to be getting a a leadership transition from violence to nonviolence from the leadership, Because the leadership is so invested in the need to control our empire through

14:15:31 violence. I don't know a way to control an empire through nonviolence.

14:15:37 So I think there probably is no is no such thing and so they're they're kind of stuck. they're very committed to to empire, and the military that goes with it ultimately it's to put international law in

14:15:53 front of war and the universal decision. The court decision of the International Court saying that this war is illegal under Nuremberg convention puts the soldiers on the field irrespective of putin and whatever he does in as war

14:16:11 criminals, and if there were leaflet drops on the battlefield to the war, to the actual soldiers who are now connected, connecting, committed international crime, to say, It is your conscience to put down the gun and not to

14:16:26 be an international criminal, and to put the international law forward, as it is ruled to protect yourself and your fellow soldiers from persecution. prosecution.

14:16:39 That, I think, is a way to put the message directly to the soldiers on the line.

14:16:43 As a question of conscience, and in the broader field to put international law and a framework of law above the framework of government and empires fighting it out.

14:16:55 This comes from the people who are around gary davis and the world is my country point of view.

14:17:01 That i'm Sure, you are familiar with and appreciate that How do we see something that is above contending States fighting for their sovereignty?

14:17:13 When really we need a sovereignty of international law!

14:17:16 That is above it all, and that depends on the people on the ground.

14:17:20 Somehow seen that. No, there is something higher than me. And who and this brother across the battle line that I am fighting?

14:17:31 Yes, I I because that's a great course to pursue the problem is that it will take very, very long time to get there, because there's such resistance at the elite level.

14:17:47 Yeah, but well, it's also of getting the the drones of the balloons to to drop the leaflets.

14:17:55 Right i'm sure you're aware that the conscripts that that Putin sent in were were very, very reluctant to be there.

14:18:04 Yeah, and a bunch ran away and so and and many have reportedly been highly inefficient, and so on.

14:18:14 So it's not it's not as if the Russian army was a bunch of gung ho marines right?

14:18:23 It was not at all new major then, but the the zeal for this fight is much more coming from the Ukraine side, where we're a lot of fathers are sending their families off to Poland in safety and

14:18:38 remaining behind, so they can fight the Russian have a but it's not that thick thank you.

14:18:51 Mostly we have 300 marines refused to get off the ship off from Maripole and Belarus.

14:18:56 People were blocking the train tracks of the ammunition trains.

14:19:03 Wonderful. 2,000 people surrounded the mayor's office and demanded that they release them and bring them back.

14:19:09 They kidnapped the mayor of Miracle, right unarmed civilians.

14:19:12 And then they also blocked the road to a nuclear power plant.

14:19:15 There. That's right, the the reason why these these incidents that you're talking about are so important is because they're spontaneous and show the potential.

14:19:27 If a population were trained and had a strategy. think what they could do when, even without training and without a strategy, they still come up with brain and stuff like that.

14:19:42 I wanted to speak to agency as it happens in our own country, since it's so difficult to confront the power elite, and that is the agency of the end of the individual, and in that regard in 1,900 and

14:19:55 91. I became very depressed at a holiday. 90 actually right before the beginning of the attack on kuwait, and I didn't know why, because it was really a very festive time, for our family and so my husband and I who

14:20:15 are members of San Fay Monthly Meeting arranged a meeting for the community at large, and and we are still together as a group 31 years later.

14:20:30 And what we do in that political action group, and I did 19 books with my husband and a few other people that showed our our actions over the first 19 years.

14:20:44 And then we saw, you know, the tired. And now I want to say that the only thing we do is what we do in Quaker meeting.

14:20:55 We just meet This developed after the war of that first war which is several months, as you know, we just meet, and we take that process of listening to each other, and persons can only speak once, and then we portion at our time But we don't

14:21:13 have any bell. it's all self-monitored and i'm always one of those few people that fail in that enterprise of speaking appropriately within the time frame.

14:21:26 But but what happens is these exchanges build our agenda over the course of our 2 h together, and we pause just like we do in Quaker meeting.

14:21:38 Only speak once, and those who were in charge of politics and usual, You know, communities of our small.

14:21:47 This is in Santa Fe. They would be writing their agenda on on their people.

14:21:54 Yeah, anyway, that's it. they would write their agenda on their forum frustration.

14:22:01 Yes, something I recommend. Well, I you're an innovator too right will I'm: writing about. yeah, yeah, yeah, yeah, you're an innovator, too.

14:22:15 Innovation on all levels, absolutely including personal growth, including small group formation.

14:22:22 On all these areas. What fun to be a human being! And George Yes, hi!

14:22:30 This is Peter Barrett. Hi! Peter, I just I can't help it.

14:22:34 I. My first action was in 1958 with Margaret Rossum outside of, or Petrick Maryland.

14:22:47 And if you've got a moment, I want to tell you what a little anecdote!

14:22:50 Okay. Her husband at the time was in charge of development in the biological weapons.

14:22:58 A lab there which we didn't know She organized the meeting in in Frederick Maryland, and I organize this demonstration, and the crew of the Golden Rule were there.

14:23:12 Oh, and we all stood in the hot sun and walked around in front of the place all afternoon.

14:23:19 Then, later, years later, she told me that she was about a 102.

14:23:25 She her husband in the lab was approached by I think the Provost Marshall, or whoever was the director of the Base because of the military installation, and said, You know, there's a bunch of commis outside the

14:23:39 gate. you need a escort to get home and her husband said, Well, it's my wife's out there with them.

14:23:49 They're all coming over to dinner afterwards would you like to join us.

14:23:59 , as you know, I tell this because times have changed so much.

14:24:05 I mean, the more things change, the more things to stay the same.

14:24:08 But to me. it's now like war is like this iceberg, and there's a visible 10%.

14:24:16 And then the war is over, which means that the iceberg got destabilized a little, and it rolled over in another 10% shows up, and we don't get down to the but underwater part.

14:24:32 And we're running out of time for that anyway. thanks i'll i'll go new it again.

14:24:39 Well, I believe that one part of the answer to that is that people are more likely to be willing to give up the justification of that violence which is security right.

14:24:54 That's that's how sold to us it's sold to us security people might be willing to give up that security issue assurance if they knew there was another way to be secure and that's one reason why i've been

14:25:08 pushing this alternative of nonviolent struggle is and and it's been especially easier since that political science study came out because it's actually more effective than violence So we're actually in a position where we can say

14:25:24 hey? You would probably agree with me that bonus has his downside as well as its upside.

14:25:29 From your point of view. But guess what another technology has shown up that is more effective than then violence for security.

14:25:39 You want to buy it? Yeah. and what? that really shifts the conversation considerably.

14:25:44 I think it does suggest that there is that invisible worldwide movement going on now transform our collective behavior.

14:25:54 Right. Of course we wouldn't be able to see it because it's unprecedented right.

14:26:00 This is this is an evolution of humanity that's right that's right. anyway.

14:26:03 I'll show up now. Thanks, thank you for your contribution or can I make a comment?

14:26:11 Yes, please do, David. You know what one of the things that I see happening which, in terms of role that we in the United States could play in terms of nonviolently are resisting this war.

14:26:26 I feel that one of the things that's happening is the media and our politicians are really whipping up the war fever.

14:26:36 And demonizing Putin mean we don't think of the Russian people at all.

14:26:44 And the whole thing is how evil Putin is and that is really, lighting the groundwork for a full-scale war with Russia, even a nuclear war, because they're so terrible!

14:26:57 And I think what has been totally lacking in our mainstream media and from our political leaders is any ownership that we have some responsibility.

14:27:13 And having caused this whole thing of NATO moving all the way up to the Russian borders.

14:27:17 And so I think, really resisting that narrative, are trying to tell the truth in the face of the half truths that are being told of why our media is just so important.

14:27:33 And I think just in mind with what else was just said.

14:27:37 I think, moving from where we are now committed to quote national security to share security or appointment security, especially in the nuclear age.

14:27:49 There's no such thing as national security it's only a shared Security for all of us, and what a difference we would have in the World, if we were thinking of in that from in that mindset. Oh, I agree it'd be usually different if we got in that Framework

14:28:10 Yes, yes. can anyone say something sure can I be recognized I'm from a ghost creek meeting in Lincoln, Virginia?

14:28:23 I'm in the Frederick county area and I really want to see a lot of younger people, and and joined in this discussion.

14:28:32 I want to see a lot of discussion about innovation in our option, to live in different ways, apart and disconnected from the military industrial complex.

14:28:46 If we want to call it that, or we might call it the world banking financial systems.

14:28:53 But we need to have other options available that are legal and recognized and considered worthy.

14:29:00 But things that systems of economics and and and survival that allow people and families to at their option, not be beholden to these much larger and possibly very much less understandable systems that seek to exploit and capitalize

14:29:25 on weakness and vulnerability. And right now it is very possible. and this is through the agency of someone like Elon Musk, for example, I have been in connection with people in Ukraine.

14:29:38 And I am looking at Facebook posts putting up by people who have fled.

14:29:42 Russia. some who were in Russia till very lately and I am exchanging with artists musicians who are horrified at your putin has done, and i'm going to say putin because it's not

14:29:56 really clear exactly who's standing next to him in his isolation saying, Go ahead and let's You know, have an all-out, aggressive assault on Ukraine.

14:30:07 There are a lot of people who are simply quiet they're complicit because they're quiet.

14:30:11 That is true, but a lot of people are really against what he has done, and they simply want to be able to live a good life with their families.

14:30:21 And, you know, granted, the systems of misinformation are much larger and deeper than they are here.

14:30:27 But there is a lot of communication going back and forth across borders.

14:30:32 The technology has allowed many people in the West to, you know very quickly and clearly articulate what it is.

14:30:40 We are thinking about what They're thinking. what we have been told that the better know is, Yes, Rebecca.

14:30:50 , Yeah. Well, we we kind of made a plan for the of a 1 h program, and we didn't think ahead for

14:30:59 This lovely, wonderful, excellent after hour yeah and so i'm just gonna jump in.

14:31:06 I'm gonna jump in and take hands because so I mean George.

14:31:10 I'm sure you're remembering and we'll respond to Rebecca in a minute.

14:31:15 But i'm not sure if charlie diamond has had his hand up for a long time, because he has something he was waiting to share.

14:31:22 So i'll call and charlie nets and June. There's a couple things in the chat people have been frustrated with not being able to.

14:31:34 So anyway. there's a june person who has something that she would like to share, and I would ask people to please raise your electronic hand if you want to share something brief or ask George a question and before George i'm going to

14:31:50 turn it back over to you. I want to get from you when you need to leave, because we will close this out.

14:31:59 At your at your your leaving time. so we're the we're at the bottom of the hour.

14:32:06 Now, do you want to go to the top of the hour, or do you want to go another hour?

14:32:10 Would you want to? No, I could. I could go till for 15 more minutes.

14:32:14 I could go 15 more minutes. Okay, so we're gonna just take a couple quick last-minute things.

14:32:22 Folks. Please make it brief. And George, you might want to respond to Rebecca first.

14:32:28 Okay? Well, yes, Rebecca, I I have some sense of where you're going, and I think the trends that you're identifying are really really important to understand and have a strong, positive dimension that that I mean I think

14:32:43 the amazing thing, you know, after I get done crying about this, the horrible suffering is going on.

14:32:51 I also have to notice that there are positive things going on in in the middle of the in the middle of all this, and to hold ourselves steady and balanced, we need to recognize both Big picture macro like Rebecca is emphasizing

14:33:05 and small picture as others have also pointed out individual soldiers, individual people doing things, and it's it's a lot to take into a lot to sort out.

14:33:17 But the there it's not all horrible is what thing I'm, not seeing June's message in the chat.

14:33:28 No, did true. Let me let me call in charlie first, though, because he's he's been very patient with the love. Okay, Yeah, i'm happy to be in your hand.

14:33:38 Right are you, George? I'm. frustrated when I when I see apartment buildings being her missiles at 5 in the morning, or theaters for people have taken shelter or churches, and then it almost seems obscene to bring

14:33:53 up nonviolence to these people when they're they're just trying to live. stay alive, and I don't know how what we say to them right I wouldn't be saying any of this to them i'm very aware of my

14:34:11 audience. so i'm I I think that we do honor people when we relate empathetically to their situation with as much complexity as we could stand and see.

14:34:32 Is there anything I can learn from this? Is there anything I can that this reminds me of?

14:34:39 Is there any way that I can grow and become more powerful as a result of this horrible thing that's going on in their lives, and and that's that's how we can look at each other's social movements?

14:34:51 We can't all be in all the social movements that are going on in this country at the same time.

14:34:57 Right, but we can be learning from each movement as it runs into his, you know.

14:35:02 Blind blind alleys is runs into its hard times and see!

14:35:09 Well might there be another way to do that, Or has anybody else solve this problem in a different way?

14:35:14 So that may sound kind of bloodless and intellectual in in a way I certainly wouldn't say it to the people who are immediately affected.

14:35:23 I wouldn't say this pray I wouldn't say any of those 2 Ukrainian people.

14:35:29 But to we who are observers I think we do have some you know, there's something redemptive about people suffering when we can learn from it that's my stance yeah So June is kind

14:35:47 of back pudding, but I just June, would you?

14:35:51 Just say a little tiny bit I just I guess i'm just a little stunned.

14:36:00 I mean I I have put forward Mary, this article from the International Crisis Group, I mean.

14:36:06 Yes, it's kind of grand to say this is a discussion for what's happening here.

14:36:12 But this could so easily involve us all in a nuclear war, and we have to think of a practical way to avoid that and to support a negotiated solution.

14:36:25 A negotiated solution, perhaps from an elite but it was the position of Zelensky all along, and it isn't very important to recognize when an effective economic boycott has been put in place by the number of players that it

14:36:38 has, I mean, and that and that that sort of people have to sort of stay the course on that.

14:36:44 But I just I just felt it's it's it's superficial not to discuss the importance of preventing another world war.

14:36:57 That's it i'm really glad you raise that because I think that's on other people's minds as well.

14:37:03 And again, it has to do with my audience. truly if I were talking to the National Security Council right or a Congressional Committee, or the you know, a bunch of corporate. leaders. I would talk in the way that you suggest but i'm not

14:37:26 So one of the things i've learned from whatever 6 60 years of teaching is that it pays to relate to people's the people that I'm talking to in terms of what their capacity is and I may have missed

14:37:42 Maybe you, June or others in the group actually have access to power.

14:37:46 Maybe you can pick up a telephone and get a Congress person on the phone, and you know, and that that'd be great.

14:37:55 I don't i'm my my lover is a super rich guy, and he says, george, I can't even get Congress for not my book.

14:38:06 The the power in this country is extraordinarily for such big country extraordinarily consecrated.

14:38:16 And so yeah, I'm just trying to relate to people the as I understand people to be.

14:38:21 And if I were in front of an audience a different audience i'd have a different tune, there was a hand that went up and then went back down again.

14:38:33 Does anyone else want to ask a last question or 2 before we head off to the rest of our dates?

14:38:43 There you are, Carl. go ahead. Yeah, I I had to write, wrote my first letter to Senators and such, and about a week or so ago, and the theme was the most important thing for me to do now is that we do not want to

14:39:14 shoot down Russian aircraft ukraine because it's just too damn dangerous. and this was thought to my audience like George was saying, the I would say more if time permitted in my letter.

14:39:36 But I also knew my audience. You must be pleased that Biden agrees with you.

14:39:42 That was part of my letter. Yeah, So we've got 3 hands popped up when I when I suggested that, and we have not yet heard from Lynn Adamson.

14:39:57 So let's let's start with you lynn thanks for keeping track.

14:39:59 Mary, Thank you, I'm calling in from Toronto and definitely following what's happening with Ukraine, I'm Co-chair of the Canadian voice of women for peace and in other rules are working mainly on

14:40:15 climate. But I really just wanted to pop up we're around this topic of how to convey that we do not want military intervention.

14:40:26 In the situation in Ukraine, because here in Toronto there have been a couple of articles just written on the weekend in our paper, advocating for providing the no-fly zone which even if it gets

14:40:41 us into nuclear war Honestly, these 2 articles in major papers, so we'll be responding to them.

14:40:49 But I also wanted to point out to folks that Michael Moore Michael Moore wrote something.

14:40:57 I'll just put it in the Chat but I can only send it to Kurtis and Kathy.

14:41:00 It looks like. But Michael Moore has a posting in which he really is calling on people to express themselves to to the government, which is you know, at least to back them up on on non-intervention.

14:41:17 It is extremely dangerous. it's it's it's quite scary.

14:41:21 So we do need to work together in a thank you well let's see we've got 2 more hands, and maybe if we're real quick with both of them, we can have another 1 min of worship before we leave so

14:41:41 David give a heart song was on that's still very good thank you friends, most of my adult life I have because of family connections.

14:41:52 I've known about and been inspired by the example of a little village in France.

14:42:00 Historically Huguenot Protestant village there is always had a an uneasy relation with whatever government there was.

14:42:08 Shambo served in Yomo, managed to help.

14:42:16 About 5,000 people escape the Nazis somewhere around 3,000 Jews.

14:42:23 At the beginning of the Vichy government's collaboration with the Germans, the pastor of the church there, Andre Chokme gave a sermon.

14:42:38 Think some of it has been published. We could read it, calling on his parishioners to resist you just with the weapons of the spirit.

14:42:52 Talking about our audience. I think that we can use some spiritual language here, I'm remarked that Paul, in the writings and what we call the New Testament, said we contend not against flesh and blood, but against principalities,

14:43:10 and powers. We might translate that in secular language, to say structural institutions.

14:43:20 But violence that goes beyond the individual that would push us past demonizing that horrible bad man, Vladimir Putin, or even the structure of the oligarchy, believe that we are called to look at what spirit we connect

14:43:42 with, and what we embody all around us I see the spirit of war, including good people who say we've got to support the troops.

14:43:55 In this case it's the troops how's the Ukrainians?

14:43:57 And we're gonna wear yellow and blue and right here in my college.

14:44:02 We have students raising money further rec Ukrainian army.

14:44:08 So to get beyond thinking, How do we support the good guys against the bad guys?

14:44:17 To think more globally to think. What is it that we have in common with the Russian people and their soldiers who are going home?

14:44:28 Those who rush will take back by the thousands. It may be scores of thousands of dead bodies.

14:44:35 What is it that is in our own spiritual tradition that helps us resist the spirit of war?

14:44:45 Which then can open us to the spirit of creativity and all these things we've heard so some of that struggle needs to be an inward one, and I stop here because we don't have more time.

14:44:59 But I would love to keep this going. You came in right with the Hagan house.

14:45:12 One last comment or question from Paul Roden. Barbara.

14:45:17 Joseph. Yes, thank you for doing this, and thank you, George.

14:45:21 I just want to say Tuesday at 12, noon, Eastern Standard time at the University of Notre Dame is a webinar for 1 h.

14:45:30 Nonviolence in the ukraine at the Croc Center for peace studies.

14:45:36 I'm sure if you Googleize University notre dame crock center for non peace studies, you able to get to it.

14:46:03 I sent this invitation and hopefully they'll catch up with you and let's just center together for another minute, and then I'm just gonna like end meeting with the little end meeting.

14:46:19 It's just been really amazing and George, you too and I would like to say, Let's all go for the love and the commonality that binds every man, woman, child.